Reviewer Comment Form

**REVIEWER’S COMMENTS**

Note to reviewers: Comments on this sheet will be sent to the author(s). If you wish your identity to be known to the author(s), please make a statement indicating you wish your identity to be known and sign at the end of this form, otherwise do not sign. Please return this form, the confidential rating form, and the copy of the manuscript to the Associate Editor **within TWO WEEKS**.

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Manuscript No. 8-1-30-15 Reviewer No. 2

Author: Stewart et al 15

Title: Age, Growth, and Size of Lake Superior Pygmy Whitefish (Prosopium coulterii) in 2013

Overall this is an interesting paper on a little-known, enigmatic species. The analyses are appropriate and thorough. The relevant literature is summarized and well-integrated. Conclusions follow from the Results, and the implications of the study are clearly stated. A nice contribution. I have only a very few minor comments:

L 289 – should be Sweden, not Norway

Table 3 – to give readers a sense of the geographic distribution of the various pygmy whitefish study sites in the literature, I’d like to see the state or province given for the various lakes mentioned. Also, given the discrepancy between scales and otoliths found in this study, it should be indicated somewhere which studies based their ages on otoliths (which I assume was what was used for the data presented in the table for this study – this should be specified) and which were based on scales.

Figure 1 – If possible, it would be helpful to also show the locations used in the Eschmeyer and Bailey (1953) study, and to label locations mentioned in the text or tables (e.g., Apostle Islands, Isle Royale, Keweenaw Bay.

Reviewer's Signature \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Return to: Associate Editor